

12<sup>th</sup> ELA Socratic  
Classroom

Student: I don't see it. Yeah.

Teacher: Good morning. [crosstalk 00:00:02] Are we going to do anything? [inaudible 00:00:03]. This is Cameraman and Cameraman.

Cameraman: Hi.

Teacher: Just kind of ignore them [inaudible 00:00:13]

Cameraman: We're not important.

Teacher: As they will be filming. They will be back on the fifteenth and we haven't decided whether it's period one or period two. [crosstalk 00:00:27] Then there's one more videotaping from admin. Do you know when?

Student: He was going to talk to ... Mr. [inaudible 00:00:38] was going to talk to [inaudible 00:00:39] of ideas.

Teacher: That one is for administration. They want to come in to videotape, also. [inaudible 00:00:49] happening in this classroom. If I [inaudible 00:00:52] period one or two as well. [crosstalk 00:00:53]

Student: Two, two. [crosstalk 00:00:53]

Teacher: Before we get started, and if you like my abbreviation, a very old man with enormous wings. I want to remind you [crosstalk 00:01:01] ... One [inaudible 00:01:02] that I want to do is a one sentence thesis, [inaudible 00:01:06] thesis. I posted it on Edmodo everybody. It's not due till 12/07. It's fifteen points, one sentence. You can pick from any of the AP open prompts and put a PDF on all the prompts from 1970 something to 2015. [inaudible 00:01:38]. Reminder, you have a vocab quiz. I posted the quizlet study cards [00:02:00] on Edmodo. We have many presentations going on Monday. Are you guys ... Am I missing anyone's name? I have Student, [inaudible 00:02:10], Student, Student [inaudible 00:02:12] if you were on this date or not.

Student: On the seventh?

Teacher: Yes.

Student: Yeah, but I wrote that on my proposal, but I can change it.

Teacher: No, no, no. Will you be ready to go on the seventh?

Student: Yeah, I'm almost finished. [crosstalk 00:02:35]

Teacher: Then I wanted to remind you [inaudible 00:02:40] the textbook and so we're using that for your group analysis of the poems that you need to submit. We're using that as kind of filler group presentations, unfortunately, until December 16 when we break. You kind of need to carry your notes [inaudible 00:03:26] bring it to class. Yes?

Student: [inaudible 00:03:42] the presentations, just after.

Teacher: It will be after. Kind of like as filler because I don't know how long the presentations run. You guys give me estimates but then estimates and real time, they are two different things. Any questions before we go on? [crosstalk 00:03:56] I need you to pick a partner, inner circle, outer circle. [crosstalk 00:03:58] two people to partner up [crosstalk 00:04:02]. Start moving your chairs. [crosstalk 00:05:00]

Student: Do you want me to write [crosstalk 00:05:15]

Teacher: Yeah [crosstalk 00:05:16] Thank you. I also need student leader volunteer ... [crosstalk 00:05:35]

Group: Student.

Teacher: ... to run the discussion. Make sure as moderator [crosstalk 00:05:39] that you allow your people to say or finish their thoughts. Make sure that you kind of remind everyone else before jumping in or cutting them off, to acknowledge what that person has said and/or feel free then to contrast it and/or build on that person's thoughts. Oh the hot seat! Yes you can have a hot seat. [inaudible 00:06:10]

Student: Yeah, Miss [Teacher 2 00:06:11] has this fuzz ball thing we do [crosstalk 00:06:12]

Teacher: ... and I was thinking about bringing a [crosstalk 00:06:15]

Student: Octopus. [crosstalk 00:06:15]

Teacher: Hi Student. [crosstalk 00:06:16] We'll use a small [crosstalk 00:06:16]

Student: Are you just going to go to Miss [Teacher 2's 00:06:20]?

Teacher: Yeah. [crosstalk 00:06:21] We're going to get our own fuzz ball. [crosstalk 00:06:27]

Student: Student. [crosstalk 00:06:27]

Teacher: I need a volunteer.

Student: Student [crosstalk 00:06:29]

Student: Student doesn't have one.

Student: I don't. [crosstalk 00:08:00]

Teacher: Wow! That thing's amazing. [crosstalk 00:06:39] This is the figurative hot seat for the people on the outside of the circle who have a burning desire, who are [crosstalk 00:06:48] have to say something. Raise your hand, that way the person on the inside circle will toss the ball to you. [inaudible 00:06:55].

Student: I have a question right away. We're getting started ...

Teacher: We are ready [crosstalk 00:07:09] up your hosting.

Student: Okay, so my first question ... They have crabs in the house. Are they just like crabs that crawl into the house or are they ocean crabs that went into the house?

Student: Somebody else thought that [inaudible 00:07:28] time, too, right. [inaudible 00:07:30] That was really weird so I figured that crabs weren't the weirdest part of the story, so it's just [inaudible 00:07:40]

Student: [00:08:00] Anyone have any idea or any assumptions as to when the setting, the time period was for the story, because we don't know?

Student: I kind of [inaudible 00:08:07] Roman era [crosstalk 00:08:07] [inaudible 00:09:59]

Student: I thought the author did this on purpose when he didn't set the time and setting because as I was reading it [inaudible 00:08:16] applied in our modern world as well, like in social media and stuff like that. I think this whole [inaudible 00:08:23] he said it so that we can just ... Whatever time period we're at, it still applies, yeah.

Student: [00:10:00] Yeah. I like that [Student 00:08:33], because it's kind of whoever Shakespeare's [inaudible 00:08:40]. The idea that Shakespeare puts in his work ... He's one of the most well known writers and everything and the stuff that he says applies to endless time, it always applies. I think that that was cool that he was [inaudible 00:10:20] bring that up [inaudible 00:10:30] time period [inaudible 00:10:32].

Student: Do you think [inaudible 00:10:33] since it was published in 1955. [inaudible 00:10:35]

Teacher: Are you guys okay for volume?

Camerman: Yeah, I'm going to put this in the middle.

Teacher: Okay. [crosstalk 00:11:19]

Camerman: ... you guys okay.

Teacher: ... if you want to put that in the middle. [crosstalk 00:11:25]

Student: Just don't bring up the train tracks.

Student: Okay, so, this [angel 00:11:31], what does everyone think of him? [crosstalk 00:12:02] Yeah, exactly. Any ideas as to what it might represent or why like he's so old, what made him so weak and stuff?

Student: I feel like his patience adds meaning to his character. I don't know ... That definitely adds something.

[00:12:00]

Student: I was just thinking, do you guys think that his ... Because he never ... The angel hardly ever at all ever talks but they just assume like the neighbor lady or whatever who is supposed to be an expert of angels, she just assumes that he came to get the baby who was about to die. Do you guys think that was the real reason that the angel came or do you think it was another reason. We don't know for sure that that was the reason [inaudible 00:13:09] assumption.

Student: Do we even know if he was an angel. [inaudible 00:13:12]

Student: He has wings but the angel itself doesn't specifically say [inaudible 00:13:17].

Student: Then it's weird in the end he just flies away. [crosstalk 00:13:19]

Student: ... think he was a bird. [crosstalk 00:13:20]

Student: I just never really thought of like ... You just never really think of angels having wings. You never think of them growing feathers. I don't know, that's like ... That's why it was kind of odd to me, it was like, "Oh, he's growing feathers", and he acted like a drunken sailor. [crosstalk 00:13:41]

Teacher: Do you want to add to your point Student?

Student: No, there's just ... Even when they try to test him on [Galatin 00:13:48] to see if he really was an angel, he couldn't even [inaudible 00:13:50]

Student: Don't angels have white feathers, too, normally? At the end it said he was growing raven feathers or something and he was trying to conceal it. [00:14:00]

Student: Maybe he was like death [inaudible 00:14:11], angel of death [inaudible 00:14:13]. [crosstalk 00:14:13]

Student: That kind of answers your question if he was an angel of death and he was kind [crosstalk 00:14:19]

Student: I thought, you know how they found him rolling in the dirt and stuff? I thought the term, fallen angel, kind of hit that because in the Bible if you've fallen as an angel you're no

longer an angel you're kind of like a [inaudible 00:14:38] kind of thing. I thought it was ironic or satirical that all these people just assumed.

Group: Yeah. [inaudible 00:14:51]

Student: Then if he is the angel of death, that we assume he is, do you think that his reasons ... Why does he not end up taking the child once he's all better then?

Teacher: I'm sorry, what was the question?

Student: Oh sorry. If he is the angel of death that come get the child, and he was too weak at first to come to take the child, why does he not, once he's better, why doesn't he take the child?

Student: Was it [inaudible 00:15:16]

Student: No?

Student: [inaudible 00:15:21] just killing the kid.

Student: Maybe they went around fate. By putting [inaudible 00:15:26] like your chicken coop they just made sure that their son didn't die [inaudible 00:15:32], the child didn't die and so they just kind of avoided fate for the first time in any story ever.

Student: Yeah, I know, I was about to say most fairy tales don't do that though, they do the opposite. They [crosstalk 00:15:46]. How come this one steers away from that?

[00:16:00]

Student: How old do you think the ... Do we know long they had the angels? They keep saying ...

Student: A while.

Student: ... the winter through summer, stuff like that. How long was it? Do we know?

Student: Yeah. I know it eventually goes into the child going to school so [inaudible 00:16:12]

Student: So they had them for a pretty long time.

Student: Yeah.

Student: In the beginning it was [inaudible 00:16:15] one.

Student: Yeah.

Teacher: They lived where?

Student: The angel? Yeah, chicken coop.

Teacher: In the chicken coop?

Student: Yeah. The fact ... The other weird thing was that the child ends up like almost like, not playing with him, but he's not afraid of him anymore. He just walks up, goes out ...

Student: He starts grooming their paws, too and stuff like that.

Student: Get out, they have little talons. [crosstalk 00:16:46]

Student: I have a question.

Student: Yeah?

Student: What is the significance of the chicken coop? It could be any other kind of cage but it's a chicken coop.

Student: Anybody?

Student: Is it ... Never mind.

Student: Okay.

Student: You should just say it just to say it.

Student: Well ... If anyone else doesn't have an answer ... Just like the idea, I think that chicken coop, the first thing you think of is disgusting, dirty, not well kept at all. Maybe that adds to the treatment of him, is they put a chicken coop there because it's disgusting, dirty, no hope, I guess. It's just like you're caged in, you're doing whatever they say. Then I also think ... This is another idea I just had. Towards the end of the story they say ... In the second to last paragraph like half way through it goes, "All he had left were the bare [inaudible 00:17:49] of his last feathers. [inaudible 00:17:51] threw a blanket and extended him the charity of letting him sleep in the shed." That's almost the first act of charity from them.

[00:18:00]

Then four lines later it says, at the start of the next paragraph, "And yet he had not only survived his worst winter but seemed improved by the first sunny day." It's like the chicken coop, they put him in the chicken coop and he just gets worse and worse and worse, then the second they show him charity he gets better. If you think like ... That would just added to it. The shed represents ... The shed isn't necessarily as bad as the chicken coop so it's just that small act of charity that ends up saving the angel and that's almost like ... Oh yeah, just the idea [crosstalk 00:18:38] Oh no, I was just saying, charity is kind of an idea that you associate with angels as they're perfected at something that you associate angels with.

Student: On that note, as the angel develops he kind of parallels the growth of the child in the story. The child grows up, the angel also kind of grows up. He grows new feathers and eventually leaves the nest like a child does. To your point about how a little act of charity makes all the difference and changes his life, are they possibly saying that a little act of kindness towards a kid who's never been loved can make all the difference in changing him from a fallen angel to one who can fly again? [crosstalk 00:19:42]

Student: Wait, anyone have anything to build off of that before we go on to another question? [crosstalk 00:19:47]

Student: Go Student [crosstalk 00:19:47]

Student: Then the thing about the chicken coop is chicken coops are used only to basically use the chickens to get eggs, so it symbolizes it not only because he has wings but they're [00:20:00] imprisoning him in the chicken coop so they can get money, so it kind of symbols that. They using him just the way that they would use chickens. [crosstalk 00:20:05]

Student: Cage them in and then just get whatever they can [crosstalk 00:20:09]

Student: ... imprisoning him. [crosstalk 00:20:16]

Student: No, I'll just [crosstalk 00:20:20]

Student: [crosstalk 00:21:13] On top of what Student was saying, I think everything people do in the story is a reflection of human nature. The author, I think, was pointing out, "Hey, this is what we do." I think when they put him in a chicken coop, that symbolized how humans ... If something is deviant from normal we tend to categorize it and cage it and point it out as what we think it is. If the fallen angel were to symbolize a child who is not normal and that we kind of treat, we kind of treat him as something we put in a cage, we diagnose this child or we say this is wrong with him ... And yeah, what Student was saying [inaudible 00:21:14].

Student: The poem by Maya Angelou, The Caged Bird ... One of the lines in that is the free bird thinks ... I can't remember exactly, it's like a free bird thing, so another breeze and the tree would soften the symmetries and the fat worm waiting on the [inaudible 00:21:35], meaning the sky is home, something like that. In that poem it contradicts a caged bird to a free bird and that kind of symbolized the angel because in that poem it says the caged bird stalks on his narrow cage and [inaudible 00:21:48] bars of rage, type of thing. It kind of shows that [inaudible 00:21:52] all this time may be a good reason why he left [00:22:00] without taking the child because he had this [inaudible 00:22:02].

Teacher: Maybe like an inner freedom kind of thing?

Student: Yeah.

Student: Okay. Any other ... Anyone have any ... Unless anyone wants to add on that, do we have

any other questions?

Student: I have a question. I just want to know what your guys' thoughts are. Why were the people so mean to the angel? If an angel dropped down in your yard, would you be like, "Here's dinner. You have a house forever." I'm just confused. They're like ... He was just such a nuisance.

Student: It's kind of what Student said. It's kind of human nature. If you can exploit someone for your own benefit, that's what you're going to do. I guess it was kind of survival for them because didn't they charge to [crosstalk 00:22:52]

Student: Not initially. [inaudible 00:22:52] they took pity on the angel actually, because [crosstalk 00:22:54] told them to kill him and so that's when they put it in the cage. It wasn't till swarms of people came that they started [inaudible 00:23:07].

Student: The commercialism part, where they charged for admission?

Student: Mm-hmm (affirmative), yeah. [crosstalk 00:23:11]

Student: It says in the beginning that angels in those times were the fugitive survivors of a spiritual conspiracy. It doesn't really sound like angels like much. If they started off right off the bat [crosstalk 00:23:24]. It doesn't really sound like a complement survivors of spiritual conspiracy.

Teacher: We have other religious figures in the story where they may not be as portrayed as respectful or as we might expect. [crosstalk 00:23:38]

Student: [00:24:00] He's constantly giving these absurd ideas of how to test the [inaudible 00:23:49], too. Right? He's in no rush to actually confirm [crosstalk 00:23:57]. He goes out to his superiors and he just ...

Student: Yeah, okay.

Student: I'm right here.

Teacher: Are you shifting or are you, you asking for the ball? [inaudible 00:24:09]

Student: Okay, yeah, but then I read online that it was actually a satire for the Roman Church and human nature. Then when the Priest or whatever was trying to validate and do all these kind of things to find out ... In the end they didn't really need the Priest at all because the angel just goes and [inaudible 00:24:28] by himself. It shows that in human nature a lot of hasty decisions are made and in the end it really didn't Student.

Teacher: It meaning referencing religion?

Student: Yeah, it meaning them, the Priest, trying to do all of these things to the angel to

[inaudible 00:24:48]. Yeah.

Teacher: Oh wait, Student was waiting.

Student: Mine's completely different, like off topic. It's on the story but a different point.  
[inaudible 00:25:00]

Student: ... it was kind of like a throw at the Catholic Church because the whole reason why the Protestants and everybody diverted from the Catholic Church was because all of these rules were made and it was not about religion, it wasn't about spirituality anymore it was more like, "Do these rules." [crosstalk 00:25:33] Yeah, that's why ... He said, "Okay, I'll send a letter to him and he'll send a letter to them." It's kind of like saying, "Nothing gets done." I think it wasn't only a throw at the Catholic Church but also bureaucracy itself. In our government these days, if you want to get a law passed it's going to take [crosstalk 00:25:52] decades. Yeah. It's nothing fast.

[00:26:00]

Student: I agree with you and I think that it kind of makes me want to say like, if Jesus were to come back and be a [inaudible 00:26:09] they did not believe ... You know what I mean? Even ... I don't know ... That's why I think definitely it was like they were just trying to [inaudible 00:26:19].

Student: Yeah, exactly. I think it's that idea of separation of ideas and everything, everyone has their own idea of what's important and what's not. Some people were interested in the angel and saw the importance of it and other people were like, "Oh look, I can make money off of this." It's just kind of, everyone has their own ideas of importance on that.

Teacher: Then before we pass it to Student, I was going to ask you ... Your expectations, how you're saying, you bring your expectations and how this story then changes with what do you expect of an angel of how we should treat an angel or a Jesus, like happy to roam up on the Waikiki beach. [crosstalk 00:27:10] Student?

Student: I remember on my, when we did that project on the ... I forgot what ... The [inaudible 00:27:23], mine was on [inaudible 00:27:26] and one of the rules was the irony was that once the author starts to see the irony ... You can't really expect anything because once irony comes in, everything goes to shit, I guess. [crosstalk 00:27:39] Yeah, I feel like the author used that to kind of play on all the characters emotions. They didn't know what to expect and it was completely not what they expected, so they didn't really know what to do with it. They ... When you really ... When your expectations of an angel is this beautiful, flying creature, nice wings and all that, then what they got was this old man with no teeth, in the mud [crosstalk 00:28:10].

[00:28:00]

Teacher: Ann, are you still waiting to [crosstalk 00:28:11] add something or do you want to ... Yeah.

Student: I wanted to go back to the beginning when you guys talked about why the people were

so mean to the angel. If you read through the second paragraph [audio cuts out 00:28:32]

Teacher: The question is, is there a direct relation?

Student: Yeah. [crosstalk 00:29:44] anything to do with [inaudible 00:29:45] the child from the temperature [inaudible 00:29:46].

Student: Yeah, kind of. The [inaudible 00:29:54] walked up because kind of not coming towards the child because it said the angel really didn't perform miracles, they were more ... I forget the words ... They were more like bad things would happen when, if he cured you of your blindness then you'd have a bunch of sores on your back or something like that.

Student: That was the with the lepers, right?

Student: Yeah. I don't think ... He didn't obviously heal the boy but I think him being trapped might have healed him.

Student: You could view it in two different ways. You could view it as the child was dying and then the angel was going to come and take him to Heaven, or you could view it as the angel is really the child's guardian angel because right as he comes into the story ... Kind of setting aside all the stuff they did to the angel ... When he comes in they lock him up and whatever and then the child heals and then he leaves. If you kind of sift out all the details you could look at it that way, too.

Student: That's a good point. If you do actually think about [inaudible 00:30:57] probably for the child but also for the whole family, because he [inaudible 00:31:05] once he's there the child heals, the child grows up, goes to school and the family does so much better once the angel is there, but they still locked him up and everything. Then of course we don't ... Before he came, you know that they were not too well. Crabs were all over the house, their child was about to die basically. You know that once he comes ... And we don't know what happens after he leaves but if this plot continues you'd assume that once he leaves everything's going to go [crosstalk 00:31:32]

Student: It could also explain why the angel was so patient with all of the messed up stuff they were doing to him. He was just ... He couldn't know like, "I'm just trying to help you guys." [inaudible 00:31:46]

Student: Sorry. It's a good thought but ... And also because of him they got rich. [crosstalk 00:31:55] gave them money. [inaudible 00:32:01]

[00:32:00]

Student: Their making money off of it, I think, is criticizing the Roman Catholic Church at this time because it's mostly about satire, directed at the nature of people and his government during this time. I think he's deluding to how the Church profits off of the religion and the belief of people. I think that's what he's alluding to and how they got such a grand

house and everything. Even though they had a super nice house [inaudible 00:32:34] angel, they still didn't treat the angel well. They still disregarded it. [inaudible 00:32:43]

Student: Is it in the story ... That spider woman when she's introduced [crosstalk 00:32:48]. He's there to help the family not only with the kid but [inaudible 00:32:54] with money. I couldn't think of ... If that was the reason ... And then once that spider lady came and then she took every ... She had a good story. Nobody really knew anything about this angel that ... But then she had a story and she had everything so then she took the crowds so people would stop seeing the angel. Maybe after he felt that he couldn't do anything more for the family with helping them with money and stuff like that ... Do you guys think that's why he left? Do you guys think that the reason why he left is because he felt that he couldn't serve the family anymore? [crosstalk 00:33:36]

Student: I think ... I don't know because he left a long time after he couldn't ... He was drained of his whatever ...

Student: His what?

Teacher: Usefulness?

Student: Yeah, usefulness. [crosstalk 00:33:53]

Student: ... in the beginning though. [crosstalk 00:33:56]

[00:34:00]

Student: He has no ... In terms of the spider lady and ... He was there a long time after that happened.

Student: It wasn't necessarily up to him [crosstalk 00:34:12]

Student: I'm going off what she said. [crosstalk 00:34:13]

Student: Okay, we're good?

Student: I'm going to forget what Ivan said. [crosstalk 00:34:21]

Student: Okay, maybe not only the angel knew when he was going to leave but that he felt that whenever the family felt that he was done using whatever, whatever, whatever, then he decided to leave.

Student: Everyone good with that? [crosstalk 00:34:45]

Student: Student is turning red [crosstalk 00:34:46]

Student: ... something different, actually.

Student: Wait, can I ...

Student: Yeah.

Student: Okay. Just off of that ... If you think about it as angel ... Thinking about it religiously, angel is like God and then monsters are like not ... You think of angels you think of as good and monsters you think of as bad, so spiders you think of as bad but in this story you're kind of thinking like the angel doesn't seem that good. What is you ... If you think of the angel as actually being good instead of actually being bad, but like God doesn't necessarily present all of the solutions and directly as they may seem. People have to see them for what they really are so that's kind of maybe ... The neighbor lady does see the angel as an actual angel but then everyone else doesn't see that this angel is important. What if you compare them to ...

[00:36:00] The angel is good and the spider is bad, so the angel did actually come to help the family and then the spider is like the devil's tool, if you want to think about it. The angel's coming to help the family and he does help them and they end up getting money but while they're getting money a spider comes into town to try and [crosstalk 00:36:13] to try and halt ... It's like the battle between good and evil, kind of idea. Good comes to help the family and then bad shows up to try and stop good and that whole idea. Maybe that's why the angel stayed longer than it could be useful because it had to make sure that bad didn't win, that good was going to [stay 00:36:32] with them. Does that make sense?

Group: Yeah.

Student: Okay. [crosstalk 00:36:37]

Student: It also brings up that idea that we talk about with every single [inaudible 00:36:41] discussion of one person has to suffer for the [crosstalk 00:36:46]. It always has to ... It always seems to go back to that. It always seems that he's the one, he was the one getting burned. He was getting ... I don't know what you call it ... [crosstalk 00:36:59] He was in a really dirty chicken coop. He was barely conscious. He was doing all of this stuff. But he didn't really oppose too much so that it's showing that he willingly took on all of that, all of those burdens so the other family could prosper. [inaudible 00:37:24] [crosstalk 00:37:23]

Student: Okay, well just adding on to Student. It's kind of like ... It kind of foreshadows the spider coming in being bad because there's a quote in here that says, "The devil has a bad habit of making use of carnival tricks in order to confuse the unwary." [crosstalk 00:37:56]

[00:38:00]

Student: Yeah, they're both using disguises to present their solutions or cause. [crosstalk 00:38:05] They have to ... Yeah.

Teacher: I want to ask the inner circle if there's anyone who has just one more thing they have to say before we switch partners. I do want to take a closer look at the spider woman. We talked about these polar opposites and our expectations of what religion or service to humanity as it confines one of being good. But really, she is a frightful tarantula, the size of a ram with the head of a sad maiden and it's sad that her parents, that she sneaked out of her parents house to go dance. What did they do? They ... [crosstalk 00:38:55] Wasn't there something about with the [meatballs 00:38:56] that was just really [crosstalk 00:38:58]. They threw meatballs at their daughter to [crosstalk 00:39:02]. That should invoke some kind of sympathy or empathy. [crosstalk 00:39:05] She is also ... She is a symbol as well, right, as a [foil 00:39:10], as an opposite character to the angel. Is there any ... Are there any last questions for the inner circle people before we switch on to discuss the spider woman as [inaudible 00:39:22] questions and give Student a break from taking extensive notes on the board?

Student: I was just wondering what the significance was behind the [inaudible 00:39:35] and describing the angel as this older, Norwegian [inaudible 00:39:38] guy. At the end [inaudible 00:39:40], okay.

Teacher: Do you want to wait [crosstalk 00:39:42]

Student: I was just wondering why exactly what they [inaudible 00:39:54] or what the author [inaudible 00:39:57] angel was that ...

[00:40:00]

Student: I think that the reason why they made him so old and stuff like that is just because whenever people ... It's to throw the audience off balance from what they expect. It changes the way that they imagine the story. If it was like a ... If it was ... I don't know, I don't want to say healthy or whatever, but if it was what everyone thought it was going to be, then they wouldn't have actually tried to coop him up and all that stuff then.

Student: They specifically describe him as singing sea shanties and he's got that sailor vibe to him. I was just wondering why exactly, what they connected him to the sea.

Student: Maybe just perhaps they use that as ... They live on the water. Right?

Student: Mm-hmm (affirmative).

Student: I'm assuming you run into a lot of this kind of, these kind of people, like sailors who come into town or are drunk and stuff. That might be like a problem or something that they always are facing over and over. If you're familiar or something to them, they ... So that it would be not as noticed or something and be more relatable to. They even say in here, "He seems more like a human than he did an angel."

Teacher: Let's stop there. I'm going to have the outer circle people [crosstalk 00:41:36] let's switch partners. [crosstalk 00:41:38]

Student: ... so much to say but I don't want to intrude. [crosstalk 00:41:51]

[00:42:00]

Student: ... but we will fuck you up. [inaudible 00:42:14] I'm going to lock you up [crosstalk 00:42:18] everyone's data try to see if [crosstalk 00:42:20]

Student: Student wants to start off.

Student: No I don't. [crosstalk 00:42:23]

Teacher: If you want to. [crosstalk 00:42:24] All right, it sounds like people over here are dying to say something so [crosstalk 00:42:31]

Student: No, you can go. [crosstalk 00:42:31]

Student: ... what were we talking about before we switched the circles? [crosstalk 00:42:35]

Teacher: The devil uses tricks to [crosstalk 00:42:37]

Student: We were talking about the spider and then the sailors.

Student: Okay. I think since it is criticism of the Roman Church, maybe the sailors are supposed to represent maybe an outside culture that came into the Church is what led to this entrepreneurship, this capitalism within a Church, so maybe that's why they referenced [inaudible 00:43:00]. I don't really know exact history for why the Church became like that, but maybe it was like a certain type of person that came into [inaudible 00:43:14]. [crosstalk 00:43:14]

Student: I think them talking about him being like a Norwegian sailor is teasing the Church in the sense that even though he's obviously a magical creature, whether or not whatever he may be, they have to try to view him as something that is logical, that they can think of like obviously a Norwegian sailor or something, which I think is like ... It's all about a satire of the Roman Catholic Church and I think that's one of the things that they're teasing; them trying to have to make everything in their own terms and stuff.

[00:44:00]

Student: In relation to the spider woman, she's also a completely mythical creature and really hard to understand. It seems that all the people in town fully understand her more than they do the angel. It probably has something to do with her story, being easier to understand, than the bird man; he can't talk to them at all and so they don't know what his story is. It's easier to decipher her and kind of make sense of her than it is of the bird man.

Student: I think that's exactly why the ...

Student: Bird man.

Student: Oh sorry.

Student: ... and not really talk to religion because then she's like the easier religion to follow and understand [crosstalk 00:45:32]. The bird man is not as clear.

Student: Exactly. I think that's why the spider woman was introduced first, was [crosstalk 00:45:46]

Student: No, bird man.

Student: Bird man was introduced first.

Student: [00:46:00] No, no, no, the reason why she was introduced in the first place, not the first character that was ever introduced in the entire universe. [crosstalk 00:46:00] the reason why she was introduced was because she [inaudible 00:46:05] everyone could sympathize for that. Everyone can't understand, he doesn't really talk, he's very different and then I think that was used to pull everyone away from the angel. If we're going to use symbolizing, like what she said about religion, it's kind of using this person or the spider lady is used to draw kind of all the good things that was happening to the family away. [crosstalk 00:46:38]

Student: I think because the way this author writes, which is through magical realism, it's that these characters, although they're mythical and magical, whatever, it's supposed to be understood in the story as it's real, like realism. I think in that sense the reason why he writes his stories like that is so that they're more symbolism than actual creatures. Rather than being a spider lady, although she is a spider lady and that's weird, she should be looked as more as what she symbolizes than her being a spider lady.

Student: I think that ... Do you mind if I ...

Student: No.

Student: Okay. I think that going kind of back, also timing this idea with the irony and the contrast between the two, and this idea that God and the devil may not come as you think they're going to. The spider lady, right, her condition has been deemed by God because in her story, right, the bolt of lightning came down from the Heavens and that's how she got her gift. Whereas this angel seems like a fallen angel so we're assuming that he's kind of demonic but kind of like this contrast that he's actually the one that brought good to the family. Back to what Student was saying, that maybe he's the guardian angel but how the Church was always so, like, "Oh, only what we say is right and we're only looking for kind of what's obvious."

[00:48:00]

They missed a lot of good things that happened and came from places where they didn't expect it to. Again to the foreigners point, a lot of times they looked at foreigners and said, "Nothing good can come with you." They were doing good things but the Church persecuted them for it despite the fact that they were clearly doing good. What they

thought was deemed by God was actually doing bad like the crusades and things like that. [crosstalk 00:48:36]

Student: Yeah, what Student said. [crosstalk 00:48:37]

Student: ... everything we said. We totally forgot about her.

Student: Yeah, I have to write all of that. [crosstalk 00:48:53]

Student: Oh, what was I going to say? Oh yeah, [inaudible 00:49:00] with the spider lady. I think she represents other religions. It's trying to show the fickle nature of the people who follow these religions, how they were all so into bird man or whatever you want to call, I don't think he's an angel. [crosstalk 00:49:15] Bird man ... They're all into him and then when his miracles that he produced weren't actually helpful miracles, which I think is also satire of the mindset that a lot of people who follow the Roman Catholic Church have, [inaudible 00:49:31] produce miracles for them and stuff, I think it represents how fickle people are in religion, following only what they see as this person has a clear cut story behind them and she's like this. It shows human nature, how they're so quick to ship it.

Student: Yeah. I agree with that. I think the story really, he's talking about human nature and that kind of ties in because humans kind of tend to have this blind consumerism ideal where if this band wagon concept where if this is good then we'll just follow that if this is good. I think this is ... What's his name ... Mark [Pez's 00:50:12] way [crosstalk 00:50:13]

Student: Mark [Key's 00:50:13], never mind. [crosstalk 00:50:14]

Student: Oh yeah. I don't know [inaudible 00:50:19].

Student: Okay wait. [crosstalk 00:50:20]

Teacher: ... you can write the first name.

Student: I think this is obvious, but I know everyone in here read the spark notes.

Student: No. [crosstalk 00:50:34]

Student: I always read the ... You read the story and then you read the spark notes, their stuff [inaudible 00:50:43] gives you great understanding. Trust me [crosstalk 00:50:47] They have such good information on it. If you read the story yourself to get the feel of how it is and then you read some of ... Every story that we read, I finish it like, "What the heck was that about? I'm so confused." Then it helps you [inaudible 00:51:04]

Student: This story ... The angel [crosstalk 00:51:10] notes the spider because [crosstalk 00:51:11] really deep [crosstalk 00:51:12]

Teacher: Can you clarify that thought? [crosstalk 00:51:14]

Student: The story represents the angel and then spark notes is like the spider [crosstalk 00:51:24]. It's super duper easy to digest and they say [crosstalk 00:51:31] explore every single [crosstalk 00:51:36]

Student: No, no, no, Student is saying that the story itself is the angel, it's hard and you have to actually analyze all this kind of stuff, and the spider lady is that short, where it just summaries, but you don't actually get in depth. [crosstalk 00:51:53]

Student: No, that was [crosstalk 00:51:54]

Teacher: ... and I want you repeat that because [crosstalk 00:51:56]

[00:52:00]

Student: ... relating it to what's happening now, what's happening right here in this modern time. [crosstalk 00:52:04] purpose of literature to be ever evolving to adapt to what's happening in the now.

Student: [inaudible 00:53:01] link to what was happening in his country. In Columbia in 1955, they had a lot of, I think, foreign politics coming in trying to control the country and they also had a civil war at that time, I think, with Peru over land disputes. I think the feeling in the country was, they weren't so happy with their government. Almost all of his fans are just taking shots at the government who ... His use of magical realism, I think ... This might also be about his government trying to be [inaudible 00:52:59] satire [inaudible 00:53:00] [crosstalk 00:53:00] No. Go look at the spark notes [crosstalk 00:53:02]

Student: I don't think Student was finished with his point. [crosstalk 00:53:06]

Student: No, I was just saying ... I was just building on what Student said. Well actually I really like the point so I'm going to change my point. What if the government that where he lived right now, was like the angel. It wasn't exactly pretty but it had a lot to it. It had potential and it had things you needed to understand but then when other foreign policies and people and governments were coming in, it was like the spider lady. There's ... It's so much easier like they say here, they want to examine her and [inaudible 00:53:50] recount the details. It's so easy to understand because you're able to just ...

[00:54:00] It's just straight at you and so exotic to understand. Whereas the angel is more thought of ... The foreign ones are exotic but the thing that they have right now is more beautiful, angels are more beautiful than spiders. What they have is beautiful but they don't see the equality in what they have at that time.

Then you've got these [inaudible 00:54:25] the religion idea of the religion they have is beautiful but they don't accept it because they're more exotic and [inaudible 00:54:40] to understand whereas they don't understand that [inaudible 00:54:44] as in the angel [inaudible 00:54:46] come straight out and be like, "I'm going to help you", because he's bound for a [inaudible 00:54:50]. Whereas the devil, which the spider is, is more exotic

and more like the other Churches, exotic and everything, and so it's like [inaudible 00:55:03]. [crosstalk 00:55:05]

Student: Yeah, I think something important that we kind of lost over is if we're really going to see that old man as an angel and a God send, then we're basically calling ... What was his name? Father [Gonzagas 00:55:17] or something? We're calling him a false prophet here.

Student: Yeah, Gonzaga.

Student: I guess he was ... It basically blows onto, are you going to stand with that wise old neighbor lady or Father [Gonzagas 00:55:29]? [crosstalk 00:55:31]

Student: I think the whole point ... Oh, sorry. [crosstalk 00:55:34] I think that was the whole point of the story is that, whenever religion gets called into something, especially in these kind of situations that, this Father Gonzales guy, the Priest of the Church, didn't really actually do anything.

Student: I think it's Father [crosstalk 00:55:58]

[00:56:00]

Student: ... waited for the word of the Church though. [crosstalk 00:56:01]

Student: Whether or not [crosstalk 00:56:02] Yeah. Whether or not [inaudible 00:56:03]

Student: Exactly. Is that [crosstalk 00:56:05]

Student: Whether or not he went there or he didn't, he had not affect on the actual, on the bird man. I didn't know what to call [crosstalk 00:56:16]

Student: That's because he waited for the decision of the Church. I think if you're going to [crosstalk 00:56:22]

Student: They still ran tests on him, right? [crosstalk 00:56:24]

Student: Ran tests? [crosstalk 00:56:25]

Student: ... is taking, I think, a shot at the Church.

Student: Exactly. [crosstalk 00:56:34]

Student: If you guys are going to take a shot at the Church [crosstalk 00:56:40]

Student: Oh sorry, sorry, sorry. [crosstalk 00:56:41]

Student: No, no, it's okay. [crosstalk 00:56:43]

Student: I'm sorry. I'm sorry. [crosstalk 00:56:44]

Student: They ran tests [crosstalk 00:56:44]. It's not that he didn't do anything involving the angel at all, he still actually did stuff, but it wasn't significant at all. It didn't actually change and it didn't prove and disprove. [crosstalk 00:56:57]

Student: That was it.

Student: That was it. [crosstalk 00:57:02]

Student: They just ran tests on him to prove ... I read this in spark notes, I'm a phony [crosstalk 00:57:09] They did this to prove God's omnipotence and all this kind of stuff and His ongoing wisdom, but it didn't actually change the [crosstalk 00:57:20]

Student: I feel like the Church misses the point that just because ... To be a God send, you don't have to be an angel.

Student: I think that whole thing was teasing the Church because [crosstalk 00:57:30] he tries to talk so the angel [crosstalk 00:57:31]

Student: I don't think it's angel ... Bird man.

Student: He tries to talk to bird man in Latin and because the bird man doesn't speak Latin they suppose he's not an angel, which is taking a shot. Just because that's the language that you use doesn't mean that that would be the language of God. Then also he ... What else did he do?

Student: They tried Jesus' [crosstalk 00:57:52]

Student: No they did something else. [crosstalk 00:57:54]

Student: I thought it was [crosstalk 00:57:57]

Student: The only thing he talked about was [crosstalk 00:57:59]

[00:58:00]

Student: ... Arabic and his wings weren't nearly as beautiful as you'd expect from something of Heaven [crosstalk 00:58:07]

Student: He looked too much like a man.

Student: Yeah, he looked too much, too ugly, too ...

Student: So because the thing that he's trying to teach is because this angel didn't look like the way that everyone was supposed to, that he questioned and then he had to run all

these tests and he acted like he had to question the validity of whether or not this was an angel or not.

Student: A bird. No, that part I think is specifically ... The other part, they take a shot at the, almost hiatus mentality is, I think he talked ... There's no way that bird man could be an angel because he doesn't know how to properly address ministers or whatever he is. It quotes that in there. I think that whole section with him is supposed ... He's representative of that whole customs mentality and stuff within the Roman Catholic Church. If something was actually an angel, it would actually be the other way around, it wouldn't be the angel needed the proper way to address a minister, it would be the other way around. [crosstalk 00:59:08]

Student: If Father [Gonzaga 00:59:13] couldn't do anything, than what is his purpose?

Student: That's the whole satire [crosstalk 00:59:19]

Student: His purpose there is just to show how him, as a character, is just [futile 00:59:25].

Student: Or since he represents the Catholic Church, he's saying the Catholic Church isn't the [crosstalk 00:59:31]

Student: I think I got it. Okay, so the angel represents ... I'm sorry. The angel kind of represents Jesus because in the Bible there was a time when Jesus, He arrived and everyone was just hating on him and they [audio cuts out 00:59:45 through 01:03:18] ... are like if I see something amazing, whatever, I'll believe it and that's the whole point of faith. We don't see [inaudible 01:03:36] and then we believe it. You have to have faith and then proof comes out of your faith. They were searching for answers or proof that the angel was a real angel. You know what I'm trying to say? [crosstalk 01:03:46]

[01:02:00]

Student: Make it quick. [crosstalk 01:03:46]

Student: That's true because the whole point of the story is to highlight human nature and if we were to, if they symbolized the bird man as a Jesus figure, that wouldn't exactly emphasize [inaudible 01:03:59] he's trying to say. He's trying to say, "Yes, human nature, we tend not to ... Oh, we don't believe. We have an inability to believe about seeing, kind of thing." It parallels with Jesus and that's the whole satire, that's them saying, "Okay, well this happened before and that's a job at the Catholic Church." This is happening but bird man himself is not the Jesus figure because he is not ... It's not exactly a sacrifice either. He's used as a tool to emphasize human nature and how we react when something like this happens. [crosstalk 01:04:40]

[01:04:00]

Student: Bird man did not make any purposeful sacrifices [crosstalk 01:04:45] towards helping the family. Jesus purposely sacrificed himself to help humanity. Was bird man ... First of all, Jesus eventually was like by a lot of people and viewed as important. Bird man ... Never viewed as important in the entire story. [inaudible 01:05:00] Second, bird man didn't sacrifice anything himself. Third, bird man was viewed as a nuisance the entire

time, he just stumbled on the house and stuff. [crosstalk 01:05:11]

Student: Let [Student 01:05:12] talk. [Student 01:05:12] hasn't talked yet.

Teacher: ... other voices as well. [crosstalk 01:05:15]

Student: Okay. We should make it even if you're inside the circle you need the ball now because now we're all starting to get [crosstalk 01:05:23]

Student: Wait, just like [inaudible 01:05:25] it's just how Jesus, he was able to heal people and just how the old man, he was able to heal the child [inaudible 01:05:32]. [crosstalk 01:05:32]

Student: I don't know how people can't say that he wasn't giving up anything because he was actually tormented, the angel, [crosstalk 01:05:55] to himself and he didn't yell out. All [01:06:00] he did was just take it and [crosstalk 01:06:01]

Student: I've got to say something. I've been waiting too long. I've been waiting too long. [crosstalk 01:06:04]

Student: He didn't retaliate [crosstalk 01:06:10] just like Jesus didn't. Also, he got along with the child and not the adults.

Student: Can we get it to Brendan because he hasn't said anything yet.

Student: I was just wondering, you guys think it's kind of like a jab at the Catholic Church but could it also be a jab at human nature? You see [inaudible 01:06:33]

Student: It's a jab at three things, kind of first handed. How disgusted. I get a feeling of disgust when I read this. I'm like, "Wow! They treat him like that? That's just absolutely horrible."

Student: He's bird man. [crosstalk 01:06:56]

Student: Wait, just go, just go.

Student: Okay, okay. I believe that he's not the Jesus figure because the way that the author writes, he uses literary devices so that there's a complete, total difference between bird man and Jesus. As you read it, okay, [inaudible 01:07:16] was saying that bird man is completely indifferent throughout the whole story. There's such a difference between the tone of connotational aura between [crosstalk 01:07:27] and Jesus. His character in itself, the way he uses magical realism, there is no deeper meaning to bird man other than a tool to show how humans react to not normal things. [crosstalk 01:07:44]

Teacher: Student, did you still have something [crosstalk 01:07:47] Are you still waiting?

Student: I just wanted to point out, I don't know if you guys noticed but I thought it was weird that the writer of the story, his name is Gabriel and the angel [audio cuts out 01:08:09] [01:08:00] [crosstalk 01:08:09]

Student: I just looked this up because all of you ... [crosstalk 01:08:19] I was like, "I wonder how many people in Columbia, where he was born, are Roman Catholic, and I just looked it up. There's like 90%. [crosstalk 01:08:32]

Student: You can't believe everything you hear. [crosstalk 01:08:35]

Teacher: ... cannot believe everything you see.

Student: Exactly, but then Student said it earlier that it does relate to Jesus because Jesus was born in a manger. It was a really bad place where he was born and this old [crosstalk 01:09:01] Yeah, like the chicken coop. He was found in the mud where there was rotting crabs and this place is definitely a terrible place. Then, who would imagine that the most important figure in the world would be born in a barn next to some mules and stuff? [crosstalk 01:09:18] Exactly. Just like not ... A poor place, and the angel was found in a really poor place, too. [crosstalk 01:09:32]

Teacher: You're saying that everyone who is born in a decrepit village [crosstalk 01:09:46] country, possibly underdeveloped, might be Jesus? [crosstalk 01:09:51]

Student: ... one more time. Student was talking to me or something. [crosstalk 01:09:55] No, Student was like this. "Stop repeating the same stuff." [crosstalk 01:09:58] different points but it was the same overview. This class is crazy. [01:10:00]

Student: [inaudible 01:10:17] you guys are too focused on whether or not he represents Jesus or not [crosstalk 01:10:16] point of the story.

Student: This is kind of central because he's the main character. [crosstalk 01:10:20]

Student: Half of us are like, "He represents Jesus." [inaudible 01:10:23]

Student: ... whether or not he represents Jesus or not and you're looking at all these surface details that mean nothing, trying to prove that he represents Jesus [crosstalk 01:10:32]

Student: I don't think they mean nothing. [crosstalk 01:10:33]

Student: He just said he doesn't represent [crosstalk 01:10:35]

Student: I agree with Student, we're kind of going in circles. I have a question I really want to ask, so can I change the topic please?

Group: Yeah. [crosstalk 01:10:42]

Student: Okay. This is a children's story, right? If you look at children's stories ... You have something like Ariel. You're like, "Oh my God, since I have a love story about how I want to be a mermaid when I grow up." That's what a child interprets, but when an adult interprets it it's about the power of jealousy and evil and deception and all that kind of stuff and you analyze it. We've been analyzing it deeply this entire time but it is a story centered around children. If a child were to read this, what is the takeaway from it?

Student: What kind of messed up child's story is this? [crosstalk 01:11:25] I would never read this to my children? [crosstalk 01:11:28]

Student: It's pretty messed up but it all has some kind of moral epiphany at the end. [crosstalk 01:11:33]

Student: A base level moral would be like, they didn't see the angel for its value and what good he did [crosstalk 01:11:41]

Student: A child's not going to realize that. [crosstalk 01:11:44]

Student: ... when he flies away so there's not that reflection of [crosstalk 01:11:50]

Student: He kind of cares because he [crosstalk 01:11:51]

Student: It's not that they don't care, she viewed him as a nuisance, so it was [crosstalk 01:11:56]

[01:12:00]

Student: Usually there's ... You can see a moral of the story with the end of Ariel, how she wants to get her voice back and you realize that she doesn't want to sacrifice something for a guy. Kids can kind of see that, too, but there's not bold reflection of when he's gone. There's not an aftermath where they say, "Oh, these things aren't the same because he was gone. We should've appreciated him while he was here." That never occurs in the story. It just ends when he's gone. There's not that kind of reflection for kids to follow either.

Teacher: There's not a clear ... [crosstalk 01:12:36] Does that mirror anything, any other patterns in this story where we're trying to do ... [crosstalk 01:12:44] Where we're trying to find proof. Where we're trying to say, "It A then B." Right? [crosstalk 01:12:50] This story does not have that logical connection ...

Student: Exactly, so it leaves things up for grabs.

Student: I think that it's possible, too, you can take it ... Certainly I agree Student, with your aspect, but there's also the aspect that a tale for children can be about, "Tell what I'm trying to say, the deep meaning. Tell it to your kids because I don't want them to grow up in the same world that I lived in where we have the Church that was exploiting people and doing these terrible things. Tell your kids not to do this." It's a tale for your children but maybe not, maybe it's the deeper meaning that's for the children, too. I

agree, I agree, but I think there's also ...

Student: Yeah, definitely.

Student: I feel like if I read this when I was a kid I would run outside and take my chickens out of the coop. [crosstalk 01:13:42] I just feel like, "I'm about to die, a bird's going to fall out of the sky and he's going to save me", type of thing.

Student: [01:14:00] It's like, I think another face value of it if a kid was reading it was, they would see the Priest. Every character, they would either basically make the thought of either whether they like him or they don't like him. Then if they don't like a certain character, then when they grow up, they won't know it at the time but then, they're actually, through these stories, they're getting input for morals and decision making, whether we even know it or not, religious, politics, all that kind of stuff.

Student: Continuing with that, I know that with a lot of children's books that I really like like, The Little Prince ... Have any of you guys read that? When I read it when I was small, I would just read it, "Oh, it's like a mystical story. This little boy is going to all these different planets." Then because I liked it so much when I was little, I decided, "Well, I'm like thirteen, fourteen, fifteen years old now, I'm going to re-read it." Maybe this story, the purpose isn't for the children to fully understand it when they're young but to like the story enough to go back and read it later and reflect.

Student: Then they can really start understanding.

Student: Then they get a deeper meaning from it because you can see all the underlying symbolism.

Student: I think maybe that's why it's so whimsical to appeal to kids.

Student: Yeah, exactly. [crosstalk 01:15:07]

Student: Okay. I have one last question. We have five minutes left in this period. There's a song, Big Yellow Taxi, by Counting Crows, but it's a rewrite. It's a song, the lyrics are, [crosstalk 01:15:21] yeah, that one. [crosstalk 01:15:24] The lyrics are, "They took all the trees and put them in a tree museum and charged the people a dollar-and-a-half to see them, don't it always seem to go, that you don't know what you got till it's gone. They paved paradise and put up a parking lot." I was wondering if you feel like the people at the end of the story, when the angel flies away, that they feel that they've turned their paradise into ... They paved their paradise, that [inaudible 01:15:48] [crosstalk 01:15:48]

Student: [01:16:00] I don't think the angel represents paradise because I don't think the angel actually did anything throughout the book. All you guys are saying he made sacrifices. He just sat there in the cage ... His miracle is that he performed. They weren't actually miracles because [crosstalk 01:16:02] and all of the benefit that they got off of him was the money that they made putting him in a cage and selling him [crosstalk 01:16:10]

Student: Are we saying that that child that was locked in a closet didn't go through any type of sacrifice?

Student: Okay look, that's different. [crosstalk 01:16:15]

Student: Yeah, this is different. Literally, all you need to do [crosstalk 01:16:19]

Student: Obviously it's a different story but I think the themes kind of are parallel with [crosstalk 01:16:24]

Student: Just read the last sentence.

Student: Oh sorry. [crosstalk 01:16:25]

Student: She kept watching him even when she was still cutting the onions and she kept on watching him until it was no longer possible for her to see him, because then he was no longer an annoyance in her life but an imaginary dot on the rising sea. She thought of him as an annoyance. [crosstalk 01:16:41] in terms of that story. We tend to do that kind of thing. I think that could be a jab, but I don't think he, himself, was a paradise that they regret not having.

Student: Yeah, I agree. I think kind of tying it back into the idea of people who are displaced because they're not like everybody else. You see ... In my opinion, the angel did do good in the story and that's fine, your opinion, but in my opinion, yeah, he did and he came and he did good things. I think just like the displaced and the people that are different, just because they do good things, never gains them any merit in life. People still look at them as people who are different, who don't need to be cared about and so in the end he leaves the same way he came, as an annoyance, as something in the trash ...

Student: What did the angel do ...

Student: ... regardless of what he did.

Student: ... of his own conscious decision though that was good [crosstalk 01:17:35] He left.

Student: Okay I feel like we keep saying that the fact that he was passive wasn't his own doing or whatever, but I feel like the fact that they continually tortured him and yet he stayed and yet he doesn't lash out ... He could have ... He could [inaudible 01:17:52] He could have [crosstalk 01:17:52]

[01:18:00]

Student: ... stop trying to annoy him more because he did do some kind of ...

Student: He stirred.

Student: ... accident. Yeah, he stirred. [crosstalk 01:18:06]

Student: Okay, maybe he couldn't have left but I think he could've terrorized the villagers. [crosstalk 01:18:17]

Student: In the chicken coop? He was so weak. [crosstalk 01:18:20]

Student: ... so weak the [crosstalk 01:18:22] grabbed him and dragged him into the chicken coop.

Student: Originally, but I mean, this story takes place over a number of years. [crosstalk 01:18:30]

Student: ... through the halls. He could've done anything. [crosstalk 01:18:32]

Student: Yeah, but as soon as he was able, he left. It wasn't [crosstalk 01:18:39]

Student: He could've just walked away. [crosstalk 01:18:42]

Student: ... consciously did help them.

Teacher: Hey, I'm going to ask the members of the inner group, is there anything that someone is dying to say before we close our [inaudible 01:19:01] discussion?

Student: This kind of goes ... I'm sorry I'm bringing it back but you know the whole Jesus figure thing? I think [crosstalk 01:19:07] I personally think he's not the Jesus figure but there's totally like, there is a parallelism towards Jesus' story. The reason why he was in a chicken coop, that could parallel to the manger because they wanted to show that so that they can show the satire of the Catholic Church but ... There is parallelism but I personally don't think [crosstalk 01:19:27]

Teacher: ... someone on the outer circle ... Oh my God! Someone on the outer circle who has something, one last thing to say. Student? Go. [crosstalk 01:19:38]

Student: Okay, so, well, no, not really, but I just think adding to the whole idea of him not doing anything, I think he did something by not doing anything. When you read in the Bible, you learn that Jesus was, like he says, a [crosstalk 01:19:49], "Father, take this cup from me", but then he ... So basically he has a choice to not but he chooses to sacrifice with basically by choosing not to oppose it, he's sacrificing.

[01:20:00]

Student: Yeah, because choosing not to do something is still a choice. [crosstalk 01:20:06]

Teacher: Your homework is to [inaudible 01:20:08] thesis and you answer the AP prompt. [crosstalk 01:20:13] I put a definition on Edmodo where it takes [crosstalk 01:20:19] and it [crosstalk 01:20:21] your expectations [crosstalk 01:20:23]. We will continue [crosstalk 01:20:31] Thank you everybody.