

12th ELA Socratic
Main

Teacher: Good morning. Wow.

Student: Good morning.

Teacher: So exciting. I don't know, is something going on differently today? I don't know. My period 1, the other AP Lit class asked, "Are we being videotaped today? Are we being videotaped today?" I had to tell them, "Sorry. They're coming in to videotape period 2". They were like, "Oh." This is Cameraman, right? Cameraman, sorry, and Cameraman. Just ignore them. I know, sorry. As they will be filming.

They will be back on the 15th. We haven't decided whether it's period 1 or period 2, but just to let you know. Then ...

Student: Period 2?

Teacher: There's one more videotaping from admin. Do you know when?

Student: He was going to talk to ... Teacher 2 was going to talk up our ideas.

Teacher: That one is for administration. They want to come in to videotape also the teaching strategies or the learning strategies that are happening in this classroom. It might be period 1 or 2 as well. I know, you guys are like, "Period 2. Period 2. Period 2, 2, 2".

Student: Give us as much time as possible.

Teacher: Before we get started, do you like my abbreviation, 'A very old man with enormous wings'? I want to remind you, one assessment I want to do is a one-sentence thesis, I posted it on Edmodo already. It's not due until 12/7. It's 15 points, one sentence. You can pick from any of the AP open prompts, I put a PDF of all the prompts from 1970- something to 2015's exam. Reminder, you have a vocab quiz, I posted the quiz and its study cards on Edmodo. We have many presentations going on Monday, am I missing anyone's name? I have Student, Student, Student, Student, I couldn't remember, Student, if you were on this day or not. I'm sorry.

Student: On the 7th?

Teacher: Yes.

Student: Yeah, but I wrote that on my ... I couldn't change it.

Teacher: No, will you be ready to go on the 7th?

Student: Yeah, I'm almost finished.

Teacher: Okay. That's a 'yes', and Student. Then I wanted to remind you, so the last class we were looking at the poems from the AP text, the textbook. We're using that, your group analysis of the poems that uses the myth. We're using that as filler group presentations, so unfortunately, until December 16th when we break, you need to carry your notes for that poem that you're studying and just bring it to class. Okay, yes?

Student: Is it in between presentations or just after?

Teacher: It'll just be after, as filler, because I don't know how long the presentations run. You guys gave me estimates, but then estimates in real time, they are two different things. Okay? Any questions before we go on? Okay. I need you to pick a partner, inner circle, outer circle. I do need two people to partner up to take notes first half, second half, and start moving your chairs. Do you have notes, do you have paper?

[04:00]

Student: I'm almost writing on myself. Can I get update to you on Monday whether or not my project is done, from my episode that I'm developing?

Teacher: Yeah. Then also, I meant to ask you, that letter that you needed-

Student: Yeah.

Teacher: I need some kind of reminder or something, a Post-It note, something.

Student: Okay, sounds good.

Teacher: That I know where and when I need to send it.

Student: Thank you so much.

Teacher: I was like, "I have to write that", and I keep forgetting.

Student: I have my script ready and I think my film's going to be around ten minutes-ish.

Teacher: Wow.

Student: Hopefully.

Teacher: That's okay.

Student: I've got all my actors, we're filming on Sunday. We'll see how it goes.

Teacher: Okay, fingers and toes crossed that everybody shows up.

Student: I paid actors, they better all show up. There's 6 main characters [inaudible 05:50].

Teacher: Yes. That's a big production. You're quite bold.

[06:00]

Student: It's the first time ever filming anything in my life, so hopefully it'll be okay.

Teacher: Don't forget to do sound checks like they do. Right?

Student: I don't have fancy stuff, so I'm just using my little camera.

Teacher: That's some nice stuff. Do you want me here? Do you want me there? Do you want me ... okay, I'm good, okay. Can I get my two volunteers? Student, yes, you want to do first half, second half? Any preference? You want to do second half note-taking? Do I have someone who wants to volunteer for first half? Okay, thank you, Brendan. Then if you can come on this side and erase the board and grab a pen, you may take out your phones, your computers, your readers, wherever you have your posted questions, your levels 1, 2 and 3 questions. I'm looking for your replies.

Student: Do you want me to write it on the side or across the top?

Teacher: Yeah, can you erase that level 1 thing, too? Thank you. I also need a student leader volunteer to run the discussion, right? Make sure as moderator that you allow for people to say or finish their thoughts, make sure that you remind everyone else before jumping in or cutting them off to acknowledge what that person has said and/or feel free then to contrast it, and/or build on that person. The hot seat. Yes, we can have a hot seat. Okay, should we put it [crosstalk 08:05].

[08:00]

Student: Can we pass around a stapler or something?

Teacher: Yes.

Student: Ms. Puth has this fuzz-ball thing that you-

Teacher: I know and I was thinking about bringing a stuffed animal.

Student: Throw foam.

Student: A little gray octopus!

Teacher: I don't know if the octopus will land on that. Does anyone have ... in period 1, we use a small ...

Student: I have a charger.

Teacher: We use a small pencil case. Does anyone have a small pencil case? Candy, you can throw that to me. Yeah, go, run, ask her. Yeah, I need that one, too. Yeah, okay.

Student: Are you just going to go to Ms. Puth?

Teacher: Yeah, Student is going to go to Ms. Puth. We'll try to get a fuzz-ball, I'll try to get our own fuzz-ball.

Student: We're going to feel this?

Teacher: No. Can I get a volunteer, a group leader? Not somebody who's volun-toed, I need a volunteer. Thank you, do you have a partner? Does anyone not have a partner? Student has a partner, partner, partner. Can you be Sarah's partner?

[10:00]

Student: Wow, that thing's amazing.

Teacher: The size of my head. Okay, all right, so this is the figurative hot seat for the people on the outside circle who have a burning desire, who are like, "Ooh, wait! I have to say something", raise your hand and the person on the inside circle will toss the ball to you. Do I have my moderator?

Student: Student, do you want to do it?

Student: Okay, yeah.

Student: I just volunteered for him.

Teacher: We need to start, right?

Student: I have a question. We're good to start?

Teacher: We are ready to start, I'm just pulling up your postings.

Student: Okay, so my first question ... they have crabs in the house, are they just legit crabs that are crawling through the house or are they ocean crabs that just went into the house?

Student: I took it as, it helped to portray this dreamy, figurative, weird land that they live in because it was a place out of time, too, right? There was no specific [inaudible 11:15]. That was really weird, so I figured the crabs weren't the weirdest part of the story so I just assumed that it [inaudible 11:28] and the story was set.

Student: Does anyone have any idea or any assumption as to when the time period was for the story, since we don't know?

[12:00]

Student: [Inaudible 11:42] It threw me off. The whole 5 cents, too.

Student: I thought the author did this on purpose, where he didn't set the time and setting because, as I was reading it, I didn't really think about it at first and I thought it applied

in our modern world as well, with social media and stuff like that. I think this whole magic realism, it ties into that because he set it so that we can just ... whatever time period we're at, it still ...

Student: Yeah. I think that idea because it's what Shakespeare's done with his ... the ideas that Shakespeare puts in his work, he's one of the most well-known writers and the stuff that he says applies to endless times, it always applies. I think that's a cool idea, but now you bring that up, I think that's pretty cool because this can apply to any time period.

Student: Wikipedia says it was published in 1955. The piece.

Teacher: Anyway, I can just take a time out? Gentleman, are you guys okay for volume? Okay, yeah, I figured you want to put that in the middle. Sometimes they're shy but it will [crosstalk 13:25]. They always start very calm.

Student: This angel, what does everyone think of him?

Student: [Inaudible 13:53]

[14:00]

Student: Exactly, any ideas as to what it might represent or why he's so whole and what made him so weak?

Student: I drew that his patience adds meaning to his character, but I don't know.

Student: I was just thinking, do you guys think that his ... the angel hardly ever at all talks, but they just assume that the neighbor lady who's supposed to be an expert on angels, she just assumes that he came to get the baby [inaudible 14:38]. We don't know for sure that that was the reason.

Student: It has wings [inaudible 14:53]. I feel like it's weird how in the end, he just flies.

Student: That made me think it was a bird. [Inaudible 15:06] When I think of angels and having wings, you never think of them growing feathers. I don't know, that's why it was odd to me, it was like, "Oh, he's growing feathers".

Teacher: Do you want to add your point? There's a building on ...

Student: No, there was just ... even when they try to test him with Latin, to see if he really was an angel [inaudible 15:43].

Student: Don't angels have white feathers, too, normally? At the end, it said he was wearing raven feathers or something and he was trying to conceal it.

[16:00]

Student: Maybe he's ... you know the angels of death, the ones with the black feathers?

[Inaudible 16:04] That answers the question. I thought, even though they found him rolling in the dirt, I felt the fallen angel fit that because, in the Bible, if you follow that angel, you're no longer an angel, you're a human thing. I thought it was ironic or satirical that all these people just assumed.

Student: Yeah, so if he is the angel of death that we assume he is, why does he not end up taking the child?

Teacher: I'm sorry, what was the question?

Student: Sorry. Then if he is the angel of death to come get the child and he was too weak at first to take the child, once he's better, why doesn't he take the child? [Inaudible 17:08]

Student: The child didn't die until ... they just waited ... the first time in the end of the story.

Student: Yeah, I was about to say, most great tales don't do that, though, they do the opposite. [Inaudible 17:39]

Student: Do we know how long they had the angel? It keeps saying in the winter, through the summer, how long was it? [Inaudible 18:01]

Teacher: He lived where? In the chicken coop?

Student: In fact, the other weird thing was that the child ended up almost ... not playing with him, but he's not afraid of him anymore. He pops up, goes out. [Inaudible 18:28]

Student: I have a question. What is the significance of the chicken coop, because they could be [inaudible 18:43].

Student: The idea, I think, that this chicken coop, the first thing you think of is disgusting, dirty, not well-kept at all, so maybe that adds to the treatment of him is put a chicken coop there because it's disgusting, dirty. No ... because you're patient, doing whatever they say. Then I also think, this is another idea I had. Towards the end of the story, they say in the second to last paragraph, top of 3 says [inaudible 19:40]. That's almost the first act of charity from him, four lines later he says ... and then the start of the next paragraph [inaudible 20:01]. They put him in the chicken coop and he just gets worse and worse and worse and then the second they show him clarity, he gets better. If you think, that just added to it. The shed represents ... a shed isn't necessarily as bad as a chicken coop, so it's just that small act of saving the angel and that's almost ... that's the idea.

Teacher: Finish your thought.

Student: Charity is an idea that you associate with angels as they're perfected, it's something they do.

Student: On that note, as the angel develops, right, he parallels the growth of the child in the

story, so as the child grows up, the angel also grows up. He grows new feathers and eventually leaves a mess like a child does. To your point, about how a little act of charity makes all the difference and changes his life, are they possibly saying that a little act of kindness towards a kid who's never been loved can make all the difference in changing him from a fallen angel to one that can fly again? Anyway.

Student: Anyone have anything to build off of that before we go onto another question?

Student: I do. Go Student, go Student.

Teacher: Do you want to build off of Student's comment?

Student: No, mine's a little bit different.

Teacher: It's slightly different?

Student: The thing about the chicken coop is chicken coops are used onto to basically use the chickens to get eggs, so it symbolizes it not only because he has wings but they're imprisoning him in the chicken coop so they can get money, so symbols like that.

[22:00] They're using him just the way that they would use chickens. Imprisoning him.

Student: No, that's okay. Go for them.

Teacher: You guys are so polite.

Student: Off of what Student was saying, everything people do in this story is a reflection of human nature. The author, I think, was pointing out, "Hey, this is what we do". When they put him in a chicken coop, that symbolized how humans ... if something is deviant from normal, we tend to categorize it and cage it and point it out as what we think it is and if the fallen angel were to symbolize a child who is not normal and meaning treat him as something we put in a cage, we diagnose this child or we say this is wrong with him and what Student was saying, the little occupies.

Student: The poem by Maya Angelou, "The Caged Bird", one of the lines in that is "the free bird thinks", I can't remember exactly. It's like, "A free bird thinks of another breeze and the train would talk through the singing trees and the fat worm waving on the dawn, bright lawn and he makes the sky his own". In that poem, it contradicts a caged bird to a free bird and I've symbolized the angel because in that poem it says, "The caged bird stalks down his narrow cage, can seldom see through his fires of rage". It shows that if he's to be trapped in all this time, maybe the reason why he left without taking the child is because he had this life of imprisonment, just looking on the outside, being able to see what freedom really was and not being able to grasp it himself.

Teacher: Do you mean an inner freedom thing?

[24:00]

Student: Yeah.

Student: Anyone else? Unless anyone wants to add on that, do we have any other questions?

Student: I have a question. I just wanted to know what your guys' thoughts are, why would the people be so mean to the angel? If an angel dropped on your yard [inaudible 24:22], "This is such a nuisance".

Student: It's what Student said. It's human nature. If you can exploit someone for your own benefit, that's what you're going to do. I guess it was like survival for them because they take charge-

Student: Not officially [inaudible 24:47]. That's when they put it in the cage and it wasn't until swarms of people came that they tried to ...

Teacher: The commercialism part, where they charged for admission?

Student: It says in the beginning that angels in those times were the fugitive survivors of a spiritual conspiracy. It doesn't really sound like they're liking this ... they started off right off the bat. It doesn't really sound like a compliment, survivors of a spiritual conspiracy.

Teacher: Are there religious figures in the story where they may not be portrayed as respectful or as we might expect?

Student: Yeah.

Teacher: Do you have a ...

Student: He's constantly giving him absurd ideas of how to test legitimacy, right? He's in no rush to actually confirm, he goes out to his superiors.

[26:00]

Teacher: Are you stretching, are you asking for the ball? You sure?

Student: Okay yeah, but then I read online that it was actually a satire for the Roman church and human nature, so then when the priest was trying to validate and do all these things to find out, in the end, they didn't really need the priest at all because the angel just goes and he's by himself, so it shows that in human nature, a lot of basic decisions are made and in the end, we'll leave it at that.

Teacher: "It" meaning, referencing religion?

Student: Yeah, "it" meaning them, the priest trying to do all of these things to the angel to ...

Teacher: Wait. I think Student was waiting.

Student: Mine is completely different, off-topic. It's on the story, but a different point.

Student: I thought rather than the reflection, a hasty decision, it was a throw at the Catholic church because the whole reason why the Protestants and everybody diverted from the Catholic church was because all of these rules were made and it wasn't about spirituality anymore. It was more like, "Do these rules".

Student: Laws that you have to abide by.

Student: Yeah, that's why he said, "Okay, I'll send a letter to him and he'll send a letter to that", it's like saying nothing gets done. I think it wasn't only a throne at the Catholic church but also bureaucracy itself because in our government these days, if you want to get a law passed it's going to take decades. Nothing fast.

Student: I agree with you and I think that ... I just wanted to say if Jesus were to come back and be like, "Hi, I'm Jesus", I don't know, definitely it was ...
[28:00]

Student: That idea of separation of ideas. Everyone has their own idea of what's important and what's not. Some people were interested in the angel and saw the importance of it and other people were like, "Oh, look. I can make money off of this". Everyone has their own ideas.

Teacher: Then, before we pass it to Student, I was going to ask you, your expectations, how you're saying, right? You bring your expectations and how the story then changes with what you expect of an angel or how we should treat an angel, or if Jesus happened to row up on the Waikiki Beach shore, right? Where we say, "Oh, we're going to put you in the chicken coop over here. Charge admission. Five bucks".

Student: I remember on my ... we had a project on the ... I forgot [inaudible 29:15]. The author starts to use irony, you can't really expect anything because once irony comes into play, everything goes to shit, I guess. I feel like the author used that to play on all the characters' emotions. They didn't know what to expect and it was completely not what they expected, so they didn't really know what to do with it. When your expectations of an angel is this beautiful, flying creature, nice wings, then what they got was this old man with no teeth in the mud.
[30:00]

Teacher: That's an angel, right? It would be good ... Student, are you still ready to explore? You want to add something or do you want to ... yeah.

Student: I wanted to go back to the beginning when you guys talked about why the people were so mean to the angel and if you reach into the second paragraph, it says that they went to the neighbor woman who knows everything about life and death and then she tells them that he's an angel and he must be coming through that child. She obviously has some sympathy for the angel because she says, "But the poor fellow is so old that the rain knocked him down". I think that Pelayo, he got so frightened by her words when she said, "He must have been coming from the child" that he got scared and thought

he'd have to protect his child, so that's why he might have locked up the angel in the first place. The entire point of view changed on that ... wait, no, I have something else.

Do you think that is was a coincidence that once Pelayo walked up the angel, this child miraculously healed? Do you think the angel has anything to do with it or is it a coincidence?

Teacher: The question is is there a direct relationship between ...

Student: Anything to do with feeling the child's temperature, fever.

Student: Would the angel be locked up because ... not coming towards the child because it said that the angel really didn't perform miracles, they were more ... I forget the words, they were more bad things that happened when if he cured you of your blindness then you'd have a bunch of sores on your back. Yeah, so I don't think ... he didn't obviously heal the boy but I think him being trapped ...

[32:00]

Student: You could view it in two different ways. You could view it as the child was dying and the angel was going to come and take him to heaven, or you could view it as the angel's really the child's guardian angel because right as he comes into the story, setting aside all of the stuff that he did to the angel, when he comes in, they lock him up and then the child heals and then he releases him. If you sift out all the details, you can look at it that way, too.

Student: That's a good point, that if you do actually think about ... probably for the child, but also it's for the whole family because they get him once he's there, the child heals, the child grows up, goes to school, the family does so much better once the angel's there, but they still locked him up. Of course, before he came, you know that they were not too well, crap is all over their house, their child's about to die, basically. You know that once he comes ... and we don't know what happens after he leaves but if this plot continues, you'd assume that once he leaves everything's going to go back to normal.

Student: It could also explain why the angel was so impatient with all the messed-up stuff they were doing to him. "You could know I'm just trying to help you guys", if you looked at it like that.

Student: It's just a quick thought, but also, because of him, they were really rich. He indirectly gave them money.

[34:00]

Student: Making money off of it, I think, is criticizing the Roman Catholic churches this time because it's mostly about satire and directed at the nature of people in his government during this time, and I think he's alluding to how the church profits off of the religion and the belief of people. I think that's what he's alluding to and how they got such a grand house and everything, that even though they have this super nice house and stuff from the angel, they still didn't treat the angel well, they still disregarded it.

Student: Is it in the story, you know that spider woman when she's introduced?

Teacher: Thank you, I was waiting for the spider woman.

Student: He's there to help the family, not only with these kids, with money ... but it feels a reason and then once that spider lady came and then she took every ... she had a good story. Nobody really knew anything about this angel guy but then she had a story and she had everything, so then she took the crowds so people would stop seeing the angel. Maybe after he felt that he couldn't do anything more for the family with helping them with money is that ... do you guys think that's why he left? Do you guys think that the reason why he left is because he felt that he couldn't serve the family anymore?

Teacher: The idea of service.

Student: I think ... I don't know. Because he left a long time after he couldn't give ... he was drained of his ...

Teacher: His fullness?

Student: Yeah.

Student: He wasn't even full in the beginning, though.

Student: In terms of the spider lady and he was there a long time after that happened. I don't
[36:00] know, it wasn't necessarily up to him to leave. They kept him in the ...

Teacher: Student is behind you.

Student: I'm going off what she says.

Student: You're good?

Student: I'm going to forget what I'm going to say. Okay. Maybe not only the angel knew when he was going to leave, but he felt that whenever the family felt that he was done using whatever, then he decided to leave. I'm not ... just an idea.

Student: Everyone good with that? Okay.

Teacher: I still see people ... you ready? [Crosstalk 36:40]

Student: If you think about it as ... thinking about it religiously, angel is like god, and monsters are not. Angels you think of as good and monsters you think of as bad, so spiders you think of as bad, but in this story you're thinking about bad, maybe it doesn't seem that good, but if you think of the angel as actually being good instead of actually being bad, god doesn't necessarily present all of the solutions as directly as they may seem, so people

[38:00] have to see them for what they really are. That's maybe ... the neighbor lady does see the angel as an actual angel but then everyone else doesn't see that this angel's important. If you compare them to the angel is good and the spider's bad, so the angel did actually come to help the family and then the spider is the devil's tool, I guess, if you want to think about it. The angel's coming to help the family and he does help them and then end up getting money, but while they're getting money, a spider comes into town who's trying to make it stop.

It's the battle between good and evil idea. Good comes to help the family and then bad shows up to try and stop the good, that whole idea. Maybe that's why the angel stayed longer than it could be useful, because it had to make sure that bad didn't win, that good was going to save everything. Does that make sense?

Teacher: Everybody's like, "Yeah".

Student: It also brings up that idea that we talked about, every single Socratic discussion of one person has to suffer for the arrival of ... it always seems to go back to that, it always seems that he was the one getting burned, I don't know what you call that. He was in a really dirty chicken coop, he was barely conscious, he was ripped of all of his stuff, but he didn't really oppose too much, so then it's showing that he willingly took on all of those burdens so the other family could prosper.

Teacher: Oh my gosh, was he the child in the closet?

Student: Was he the child in the closet? [Crosstalk 39:15]

Teacher: Student is like ... wait.

Student: It foreshadows the spider coming in, being there, because there's a quote in here that says, "The devil has a bad habit of making use of chronicle cheers in order to confuse the unwearied".

Student: Both of you think the "skies" is to present their solutions.

[40:00]

Student: Yeah, they're using happy stuff.

Teacher: I want to ask the inner circle if there's anyone who has just one more thing they have to say before we switch partners because I do want to take a closer look at the spider woman. We talked about these polar opposites and our expectations of what religion, our service to humanity as it defines one as being good. Really, she is a frightful tarantula, the size of a ram, with the head of a sad maiden. It's sad that she sneaked out of her parents' house to go dance and what did they do? They ...

Student: Lightning struck her ... through a spider.

Teacher: Right. Wasn't there something about the meatballs that was just really ... they threw meatballs at their daughter to feed her. That should evoke some kind of sympathy or empathy and she is also a symbol as well, right, almost as a foil, as in a opposite character to the angel. Are there any last questions for the inner circle people before we switch on to discuss the spider woman and/or other levels of questions and give Student a break from taking extensive notes on the board?

Student: I was just wondering what the significance was behind portraying and describing the angel as this older [inaudible 41:42] because at the end ... okay.

Teacher: Do you want to wait until she finishes her comment? Thank you.

[42:00]

Student: I was just wondering why exactly [inaudible 41:54] what they offer.

Student: I think the reason why they made him so old is just because it's to throw the audience off-balance from what they expect. It changes the way that they imagine the story because it was ... I don't want to say "healthy", but if it was what everyone thought it was going to be, then they wouldn't have actually tried to coop him up in all that stuff.

Student: They specifically describe him as sea candies and got that sailor vibe to him. I'm just wondering why exactly ...

Student: Maybe just perhaps they do that as ... because they live on the water bay, so I'm assuming you went into a lot of this, it needs to be ... he's a sailor, so he's coming to town or he's drunk and stuff, so that may be a problem or something that they always are facing over and over so it feels familiar to them, so that it would be not as noticed. It would be more relatable, too. They even say in here, "He seems more like a human than he did an angel".

Teacher: Let's stop there. I'm going to have the outer circle people hold that thought and let's switch partners. Brendan, thank you for taking notes. Who's on the right side of the board? Student? Thank you. Do you need somebody to walk with you? Actually, I want somebody to walk with you. Can you walk with her, just because you're having a hard time getting ... is that okay?

[44:00]

Student: That's fine.

Teacher: The hot seat. You can be the child in the closet, so we all can benefit.

Student: Since you went last time ... if you want to.

Student: Let's go, Student. Student, go.

Student: All right, it sounds like the people over here are dying to say something, so Student, did you want to go first?

Student: No, you can go.

Student: I had something bomb to say, what were we talking about before we switched the circle? [Crosstalk 45:33]

Student: We're talking about the spider and then the sailors.

Student: Yeah. I think since it is a criticism of the Roman church, maybe the sailors are supposed to represent maybe an outside culture that came into the church and led to this [inaudible 45:52], this capitalism within a church. Maybe that's why they ... because I [46:00] don't know the exact history why the church became like that, but maybe it was a certain [inaudible 46:03].

Student: I think them talking about him being a Norwegian sailor is teasing the church in the sense that, even though he's obviously a magical creature, whether or not, whatever he may be, they have to try to view him as something that is logical, that they can think of, like, "Oh, I see a Norwegian sailor", which I think is trying to ... it's all about a satire of the Roman Catholic church, and I think that's one of the things that they're teasing, them trying to have to make everything in their own print.

Teacher: Yeah.

Student: In relation to the spider woman, she's also a completely mythical creature and really hard to understand, but it seems like all the people in the town fully understand her more than they do the angel and it probably has something to do with her story, being easier to understand than that of the birdman, he can't talk to them at all, so they don't know what his story is, so it's easier to decipher her and make sense of her than it is of the birdman.

Student: I think that's exactly why ... sorry.

Student: That relates back to religion, because then she's the easier religion to follow and understand when the birdman is not as clear.

Student: I think that's why the spider woman was introduced first. Birdman was introduced first.

Student: The reason why she was introduced in the first place, not as the first character that was ever introduced in the entire universe. The reason why she was introduced was because everyone could sympathize for that, everyone can understand. He doesn't really talk, he's very different and then, I think, that way she was used to pull everyone away from the angel, but if we're going to use symbolizing, what she said about religion, it's using this person or the spider lady is used to draw all the good things that was happening to the family. [48:00]

Student: I think because the way this author writes, which is through magical realism, it's that

these characters, although they're mythical, magical, it's supposed to be understood that the story as ... it's real, realism. I think, in that sense, the reason why he writes his stories like that is so that they're more symbolism than actual creatures. Rather than being a spider lady, although she is a spider lady and that's weird, she should be looked at more as what she symbolizes than her being a spider lady.

Student: Do you mind if I ...

Student: No, go ahead.

Student: Okay. I think that, going back ... tying this idea with the irony and the contrast between the two and this idea that god and the devil may not come as you think they're going to, so the spider lady, right? Her condition has been deemed by god, because in her story, right, the bolt of lightning came down from the heavens and that's how she got her gift, whereas this angel seems like a fallen angel so we're assuming that he's demonic, but this contrast that he's actually the one that brought good to the family and back to what Student was saying, that maybe he's the guardian angel but how the church was always so, "Oh, only what we say is right is right" and we're only looking for what's obvious, they missed a lot of good things that happened and came from places where they didn't expect it to.

[50:00]

Again, to the foreigner's point, a lot of times they looked at foreigners and said, "Nothing good can come of you", where they were doing good things and the church persecuted them for it, despite the fact that they were clearly doing good, but what they thought was deemed by god as actually doing bad, like the Crusades and things like that.

Teacher: Student you went, "Yeah, what Student said".

Student: Last year, I actually jammed everything we said.

Teacher: "Glenn Ho said this".

Student: What was I going to say? Yeah, we were talking about the spider lady. I think she represents other religions. It's trying to show the fickle nature of the people who follow these religions, how they were all so into birdman, or whatever you want to call him. I don't think he's an angel, birdman. They're all into him and then when his miracles that he produced weren't apt to helpful miracles, which I think is also satire of the mindset of a lot of people who follow the Roman Catholic church have of those who produce miracles for them. I think it represents how fickle people are in religion, following only what they see as ... this person has a clear-cut story behind them and she's like this, and it just shows human nature, how ... so quick to shift.

Student: I think I agree with that because I think this story ... he's talking about human nature. That ties into this. Humans tend to have this line of pluralism ideal where if ... those fan wagon concept, where if this is good then we'll just follow that, this is good, and I think

[52:00] this is [inaudible 52:01].

Teacher: Marquez.

Student: What's Marquez?

Teacher: Marquez.

Student: Yeah.

Teacher: The author. I'm sorry I interrupted, did you finish what you were saying?

Student: I think it's obvious, but I know everyone in here read the sparknotes.

Student: You read the story and then you read the sparknotes, there is stuff afterwards, gives you greater understanding. [Crosstalk 52:36] They have such good information on it, if you read the story yourself to get the feel of how it is and then you read some of ... every story that we read, I finish it, like, "What the heck was that about?" I'm so confused. It helps you ...

Student: Okay, so this story, the angel, sparknotes, the spider, because you can examine it really deep and sparknotes ...

Teacher: Wait. Clarify that thought.

Student: The story represents the angel and then sparknotes is like the spider. Super-duper easy to digest and they say, "Oh, you can just like examine it up and down and it's super easy and you can explore every single ...", anyway. That's just-

Teacher: No, he's thinking it as a ...

Student: The story itself is an angel, it's hard and you have to actually be analyzing all this stuff and the spider lady is just that short cut where it just summaries but you don't actually get in-depth. Anyway.

Student: That was just ...

Teacher: I think Student had a point and I want you to repeat that just ...

[54:00]

Student: God, spur of the moment. Okay. You're relating it to what's happening now, what's happening right here in this modern time, that's the purpose of literature, is to be ever-evolving, to adapt to what's happening in the now.

Student: It might be relating to what was happening in his country, because in Colombia in 1955, they had a lot of, I think, foreign politics coming in, trying to sort the country and they

also had a civil war at that time, I think with Peru over land disputes, so I think the feeling in the country was they weren't so happy with their government. Almost all of his things are just taking shots at the government through his use of magical realism. This might be, also, about his government, trying to ... satire. [Crosstalk 54:51]

Student: That's not really what I meant, but I'm just saying, building off of what Student said ... actually, I really like his point, so I'm going to change my point. Then, what if the government where he lived right now was the angel, so it wasn't exactly pretty but it had a lot to it, it had potential and it had things that you needed to understand, but then when foreign policies and people and governments were coming in it was like the spider lady because they're just like, "It's so much easier". Like they say here, "They both had examined her and then [inaudible 55:44]", that would recount the details and it's so easy to understand because you're able to just straight at you and it's so exotic to understand, whereas the angel is more thought of ... so that the foreign ones are exotic but the thing that they have right now is more beautiful. Angels are more beautiful than spiders. What they have is beautiful, but they don't ... what's the word?

[56:00]

They don't see the quality in what they have at that time, and you could also use that for the religion idea of the religion they have is beautiful but they don't accept it because they like the more exotic and easier to understand, whereas they don't understand that we have agency, so they have agency as in the angels and come straight out and be like, "I'm here to help you" because he's bound just to allow them to have agency, whereas the devil, which the spider is, is more exotic and more ... sorry, the other church, exotic and everything, so it's pretty much ...

Student: I think something important that we gloss over is, if we're really going to see that old man as an angel and a godsend, then we're basically calling him ... what was his name? Father Gonzaga? They're calling him a false prophet here. I guess he was ... it basically goes on to are you going to say that wise old neighbor lady or Father Gonzaga?

Student: The whole point of the story is that whenever religion gets called into something, especially in these kind of situations that this Father Gonzaga guy, the priest of the church, he didn't really actually do anything. I think ... significance. [Crosstalk 57:50]

[58:00]

Whether or not he went there or he didn't, he had no affect on the birdman, I don't even know what to call him. [Crosstalk 58:09]

Student: The decision of the church, and I think if you're going to-

Student: They still ran tests on him, right? The whole Father Gonzaga is taking, I think, a shot at the church. [Crosstalk 58:24]

Student: No, wait, wait! [Crosstalk 58:30]

Student: It's not that he didn't do anything involving the angel at all, he still actually did stuff, but it wasn't significant at all, it didn't actually change and it didn't prove or disprove.

Teacher: No, finish up your thought, too.

Student: That was it. They ran tests on him to prove ... I know this is sparknotes, I'm a phony. They did this to prove god's omnipotence and his humbling wisdom, but it didn't actually change the-

Student: I feel like the church misses the point that just because ... to be a godsend, you don't have to be an angel.

Student: Exactly. I think that whole thing was teasing the church because he tries to talk to the angel, birdman. He tries to talk to birdman in Latin, and because the birdman doesn't speak Latin, they suppose he's not an angel which is taking a shot ... just because that's the language that you use doesn't mean that that would be the language of god. Then also he ... what else did he do? They did something else. [Crosstalk 59:48]

[01:00:00]

Student: His wings weren't nearly as beautiful as you'd expect from something of heaven . Yeah, he looked too ugly to ...

Student: Because ... the thing that he's trying to tease is because this angel didn't look like the way that everyone was supposed to, that he questioned and he had to run all these tests and he had to question the validity of whether or not this was an angel or not a birdman.

Student: That part I think is specifically ... the other part that they take a shot at, the almost hiatus mentality is ... there's not way that birdman could be an angel because he doesn't know how to properly address ministers or whatever he is. It quotes that in there. I think that pulls that specific thing ... he represented him of that whole customs mentality, in the Roman Catholic church. If something was actually an angel, it would actually be the other way around, it wouldn't be the angel needed the proper way to address a minister. It'd be the other way around.

Student: If Father Gonzaga couldn't do anything, then what is his purpose? [Crosstalk 01:01:10]

Student: He's there just to show how him as a character ...

Student: Since he represents the Catholic church, he's saying the Catholic church is ...

Student: I think I got it. Okay, so the angel represents ... I'm sorry. The angel represents Jesus, because in the Bible, there's a time when Jesus, he arrived and everyone was just hating on him. They didn't believe he was the son of god because he was all poor and he ... yeah [crosstalk 01:01:45]. The king was like, "Oh, you're claiming yourself the king of all these people, you're going to save everyone. No, I'm the king", so the king turns everyone against Jesus because he's not high above everyone and I think that's like the angel because the angel has this sense of ... peasant look. The people aren't able to see past that.

[01:02:00]

Student: It's trying to show the beauty in the ugly.

Student: Rather than birdman being Jesus, I feel like the whole point of humans, we only believe what we want to believe, that ties in with this. I think about it in him symbolizing ... I think it's a parallel, but he's more like a tool than representing something. He's not the Jesus figure. [Crosstalk 01:02:48]

Teacher: Wait. Student was saying something and I didn't catch it, what were you saying?

Student: We already mentioned that it's a parallel to the sacrifice of one for the benefit of many, which is also another characteristic. [Crosstalk 01:03:09]

Student: At the very end of the ... I don't know what chapter it is, but after when he dies, doesn't he ... he gets revived and then he goes back up to the heavens.

Student: Yes, that's the parallel. [Crosstalk 01:03:27]

Student: I don't think birdman's the Jesus figure. [Crosstalk 01:03:34] Let Student talk.

Teacher: Wait. Who has the ball? Brian's going to explain, but keep it short. Daryl is also waiting patiently back there.

Student: I'll be super quick.

Teacher: Then Student can go.

[01:04:00]

Student: If he is a Jesus figure, it might make sense because Jesus came, everyone was like, "Oh wow, look at this", and that's what happens here. They're like, "Oh wow, wow, this is incredible", and then they talk to the neighbor lady and she's like, "Oh well, sorry, you kind of have to kill him", then that, actually, if you know the story of Jesus, I don't even know what the king's name was. There was a king, three wise men went and saw the big Jesus and was like-

Teacher: The Jesus thing.

Student: He said, "I can praise him" and he wanted to kill him. Both of them were both and everybody's incredible, everyone's like, "Oh wow, this is awesome", and the angel came, that was awesome. Someone wanted to kill him, both happened, and then both of them were treated horribly and then finally people may have seen the importance of him, and then he leaves.

Teacher: Wait. Hold it. Student. [Crosstalk 01:04:52]

Student: Wait.

Student: It's also the fact that faith and then religion, because a lot of people are like, "If I see something amazing or whatever, I'll believe it", but that's the whole point of faith, you don't need to see it and then you believe it, you have to have faith and then proof comes out of your faith. They were searching for, asking for proof that the angel wasn't a real angel, you know what I'm trying to say? [Crosstalk 01:05:31]

Student: Make it quick.

Student: Just slap him.

Student: Okay, that's true because the whole point of the story is probably human nature and if they symbolized the birdman as a Jesus figure, that wouldn't exactly emphasize what he's trying to say. He's trying to say that, yes, human nature, we tend to not ... we don't believe, we have an inability to believe about seeing. It parallels with Jesus, and that's the whole satire, that's like them saying, "Okay, well, this happened before", and that's a jab at the Catholic church. This has happened, but birdman himself is not the Jesus figure because he is not ... it's not exactly a sacrifice, even. He's just a piece used as a tool to emphasize human nature, how we react when something like this happens.

Student: Birdman did not make any purposeful sacrifices himself, towards helping the family. Jesus purposefully sacrificed himself to help humanity; with birdman ... first of all, Jesus eventually was liked by a lot of people and viewed as important. Birdman, never viewed as important the entire story. Second, birdman didn't sacrifice anything himself. Third, birdman was viewed as a nuisance then, he just stumbled upon the house.

Teacher: Hold on, because I want to hear also ... yes. Can we pass the ball to other voices as well? If you already spoke a couple of times ...

Student: You should make it even if you're inside the circle, you need the ball half the time.

Teacher: We need the ball.

Student: Just adding on to it, just how Jesus, he was able to heal people and just how the old man, he couldn't even heal the child.

Student: Then just adding on, I don't know how you would say that he wasn't of use to anything, because he was actually tormented. He got tired ... to himself and didn't allow, all he did was take it in [crosstalk 01:07:57].

Teacher: I don't know. Four.

Student: Also, he got along with the child.

Student: Can we get into Brendan, because he hasn't said anything yet?

Teacher: Thank you.

Student: I was just wondering, you guys all think it's a jab at the Catholic church but it could also be a jab at human nature. [Crosstalk 01:08:25] It's a jab at three things. How disgusted ... I get a feeling of disgust, but because of a lot of bigotry, it's just absolutely horrible.

Student: Wait, just go.

Student: Okay. I believe that he's not the Jesus figure because the way that the author writes, he uses literary devices so that ... there's a complete, total difference between birdman and Jesus. As you read it, Student was saying that birdman is completely indifferent throughout the whole story. There's such a difference between the tone of connotational aura between-

Teacher: Connotational aura.

Student: Jesus, he ... his character in itself, the way he uses magical realism, there is no deeper meaning to birdman other than a tool to show how humans react to not-normal things.

Teacher: Student, did you still have something that ... are you still waiting?

Student: I just wanted to point out, I don't know if you guys noticed, but I thought it was weird that the writer of his story's name is Gabriel and the angel said his name Gabriel.

Student: That's because he was born in Colombia, which is 90 percent Roman Catholic. [Crosstalk [01:10:00] 01:09:58] [Crosstalk 01:10:01] I just looked this up because I was like, "I wonder how many people in Colombia are Roman Catholic" and I just looked it up. [Crosstalk 01:10:20].

Teacher: You cannot believe everything you see.

Student: Exactly.

Student: Student said earlier that it does relate to Jesus because Jesus was born in a manger. It was a really bad place where he was born, and this old ... yeah, the chicken coop and he was found in the mud where there was rotting crabs. This place is definitely a terrible place and who would imagine that the most important figure in the world would be born in a barn next to some ... exactly. In just a ... a poor place and the angel was found in a really poor place.

Teacher: Wait. Student, to clarify your statement, your claim, you're saying that everyone who is born in a decrepit village in a third-world country, possibly underdeveloped, might be Jesus? [Crosstalk 01:11:36] I'm just asking.

Student: Student was talking to me or something.

Teacher: Communicating.

[01:12:00]

Student: "That could be in the same story". [Crosstalk 01:11:51]

Student: I was just saying, you guys are too focused on whether he represents Jesus or not, the point of this story is-

Student: This is central because he's the main character.

Student: Whether or not he represents Jesus or not and you're looking at all these surface details that mean nothing, trying to prove that he represents Jesus [crosstalk 01:12:24].

Student: He just said he doesn't represent Jesus.

Student: I agree with Student, we're going in circles and I have a question I really want to ask, so can I change the topic please? This is a children's story, right? If you look at children's stories, you have something like Ariel, so you're like, "Oh my god, it's about a love story about how I want to be a mermaid when I grow up". That's what a child interprets, but when an adult interprets it, it's about the power of jealousy and evil and deception when you analyze it. We've been analyzing deeply this entire time, but it is a story centered around children, so if a child were to read this, what is the take-away from it? [Crosstalk 01:13:13]

Student: It's pretty messed up. I would say some kind of moral, epiphany at the end.

Student: They need to see the angel for its value.

Student: A child's not going to realize that.

Student: They don't care if he flies away, so there's not that reflection. [Crosstalk 01:13:41]

Teacher: Wait, hold on, sorry.

Student: Usually, you can see a moral of a story with the end of Ariel, how she wants to get her voice back and realizes she doesn't want to something for a guy. Kids can see that, too, but there's no full reflection of when he's gone, there's not an aftermath where you say, "Oh, these things aren't the same because he's gone. We should appreciate him while he's here", that never occurs [inaudible 01:14:16] when he's gone. There's not that reflection for kids to follow, either.

Teacher: There's not a clear, logical connection. Does that mirror any other patterns in this story where we're trying to find proof, or we're trying to say "If A, then B", right? This story does not have that logical connection.

Student: I think it is possible, too, you could take it ... certainly, I agree, Student, with your aspect,

but there's also the aspect that a tale for children can be about saying, "Tell what I'm trying to say with deep meaning", tell it to your kids because I don't want them to grow up in the same world that I lived in where we have the church that was exploiting people and doing these terrible things. Tell your kids not to do this. It's a tale for your children, but maybe it's the deeper meaning that's for the children, too. Not only ... I agree, I think you're also ...

Student: I feel like if I read this when I was a kid, I would run outside and take my chickens out of the coop.

Teacher: Be free!

Student: A bird's going to fall out of the sky and he's going to save me.

Student: I think, another face value of if a kid was reading it was they would see the priest ... every character, they would either basically make the thought of whether they like him or they don't like him and then if they don't like a certain character, then when they grow up, they won't know it at the time, but then they're actually, through these stories, getting input from walls and decision-makings even though they're not religious, politics.

Student: Continuing with that, I know a lot of children's books that I really liked, like "The Little Prince", have you guys read that? When I was small, I would just read it, "Oh, it's like a mystical story, like this little boy is going to all these different planets", and then because I liked it so much when I was little, I decided, "Well, I'm not 13, 14, 15 years old now, I'm going to re-read it". Maybe this story, the purpose isn't for the children to fully understand it when they're young but to like the story enough to go back and read it later and reflect, and get a deeper meaning from it. You can see all the underlying stuff of what's happening.

Student: I think maybe that's why it's so whimsical to ...

Student: Yeah, exactly. It's just an adventure.

Student: I have one last question, we have five minutes left in this period. There's a song, "Big Yellow Taxi" by Counting Crows, but it's a rewrite ... yeah, that one.

Teacher: Yellow ... what is the song called?

Student: "Big Yellow Taxi" by Counting Crows. The lyrics are, "They took all the trees and put them in a tree museum and charged the people a dollar and a half to see them. Don't it always seem to go that you don't know what you've got until it's gone. They paved paradise and put up a parking lot". I was wondering if you feel like the people at the end of the story, when the angel flies away, that they feel that they've turned their paradise and just paved their paradise. They let something go away [crosstalk 01:17:39].

Student: I don't think the angel actually did anything throughout the book. All of you guys are thinking it's ... he just sat there in the cage, his miracles that he performed were not his miracles because they didn't help. All of the benefit that they got off of him was the money that they made putting him in a cage and selling him. Are you saying that that child that was locked in the closet didn't go through any type of sacrifice? [Crosstalk 01:18:00] [01:18:07]

Student: Obviously, it's a different story, but I think the themes are parallel.

Student: Just read the last sentence.

Teacher: What is the last sentence?

Student: "She kept watching him even when she was through cutting the onions and she kept on watching him until it was no longer possible for her to see him, because then he was no longer an annoyance in her life but an imaginary dot on the horizon of the sea". She thought of him as an annoyance. [Crosstalk 01:18:34]

Student: In terms of that story, we tend to do that, I think that could be a job that I don't think he, himself, cared what they said ... they regret ...

Student: I agree. I think turning back into the idea of people who are misplaced because they're not like everybody else, but in my opinion the angel did do good in the story, that's fine, it's your opinion. In my opinion, he did good things, but I think just like the displaced and the people that are different, just because they do good things never gains them any merit in life. People still look at them as people who are different, who don't need to be cared about, and so in the end he leaves the same way he came: as an annoyance, as something in the trash.

Student: What did the angel do? This whole conscious decision that was good-

Student: I feel like we keep saying that the fact that he was passive wasn't his own doing, but I feel like the fact that they continually torture him and yet he stays and yet he doesn't ... he has huge wings, he could've done terrible things. [Crosstalk 01:19:44]

Student: Stop trying to annoy him, more because he's doing some kind of accident ... yeah, he's stubborn. [Crosstalk 01:20:01] [01:20:00]

Student: He couldn't have just left. The whole time it's implying with the wingspan, it talked about-

Student: He could've terrorized the villagers. [Crosstalk 01:20:12]

Student: Pelayo grabbed him and dragged him into the chicken coop.

Student: Originally, but this story takes place over a number of years.

Student: He walks through the halls, he could've done anything. As soon as he was able, he left.
[Crosstalk 01:20:31]

Teacher: Okay, I'm going to ask the members of the inner group, is there anything that someone is dying to say before we close our Socratic discussion? Go quickly.

Student: I'm sorry, I'm bringing it back, but you know the whole Jesus figure thing? I'm sorry.

Teacher: Go.

Student: I personally think he's not the Jesus figure, but there's totally a parallelism towards the Jesus story. The reason why he was in a chicken coop, that could parallel to the manger because they wanted to show that so they can show the satire of the Catholic church. There is parallelism, but ...

Teacher: There's someone on that outer circle. Oh my gosh, someone on the outer circle who has something, one last thing to say. Student, go.

Student: Not really, but I just think adding to the whole idea of him not doing anything, I think he did something by not doing anything. When you read the Bible, you learn that Jesus-

Teacher: Hold on.

Student: This impossible ... from me, but then ... basically, he has the choice to not, but he chooses to sacrifice for ... basically, by choosing not to oppose it, he's sacrificing it.
[01:22:00] [Crosstalk 01:21:58]

Teacher: You have homework. It's to post the moral end thesis and your answer to AP prompt. Magical realism, I put a definition on Edmodo where it takes the familiar and it changes your expectations with the magical. We will continue, a few closing thoughts next class. Thank you everybody.